

Minutes

RTA Board of Trustees
9:00 a.m., May 15, 2018

Present: Clough (Acting Chair), Britt, Elkins, Lucas, McCall, Moss, Norton, Serrano, Welo

Not present: Nardi

Also Present: Anderson, Benford, Bitto, Bober, Brooks-Williams, Breihl, Burlij, Burney, Burton, Calabrese, Catalusci, Caver, Cranford, Czeck, D'angelo, Davis, Feliciano, Ferraro, Fields, Garofoli, Gautam, Harris, Jaszczak, Johnson, Kacorek, Kadleck, Kimbro, Kirchmeir, Kirkland, Krecic, Lamb, Laule, Lee, Loh, Lozada, Masek, McCarthy, Opett, Pickett, Pinkney-Butts, Raguz, Randalson, Schipper, Scott, Slesinger, Shariff, Smith (E), Smith (K), Sims, Sutula, Togher, Vukmanic, Wiehe, Young, Zeller

Mayor Clough said he'd like to take the meetings out of order, conducting the Board meeting first. He called the meeting to order at 9:00 a.m. The secretary called the roll and reported that nine (9) board members were present. He introduced the newest member of the board, Kelley C. Britt, transit planner at Northeast Ohio Areawide Coordinating Agency (NOACA).

The Secretary advised that notice of this meeting has been posted more than twenty-four hours in advance of the meeting, that the usual notification has been given the news media and other interested persons, and that all requirements of the Ohio Revised Code and Rules and Bylaws of this Board regarding notice of meeting have been complied with.

Mayor Clough stated that the minutes from the March 27, 2018 Board meeting had been previously distributed and reviewed and asked whether there were any additions and/or corrections. No changes were presented and the minutes were approved.

Invitation for public comment on agenda matters – (2 minutes)

1. Rev. Pamela M. Pinkney-Butts – Cuyahoga County – She is concerned about Reso No. 37 concerning Millstone and the Opportunity Corridor and who is receiving the opportunities. She disagrees with the two minute public comment limit. She wants to discuss what is happening against the former chairman of the board. RTA is losing money with people riding free. Transit Police is being used against the poor and non-whites. Politicians should not attend the meetings around election time when they don't come to meetings on a regular basis.
2. George Zeller – Cleveland, OH – He spoke to Reso No. 47 regarding the capital budget. Sales tax is on budget. The rest of the figures are bad. Sales tax is down 9.4%, but higher than the last few months. Peak revenues from 2001 are down \$2.2 MI a month or 11.6%. That's a \$22.7 MI yearly loss. There has been 64 months in a row where job growth in Ohio is below the national average, mainly because of austerity policies, cutting local governments and cuts to transit authorities.

Committee reports

There were no committee reports.

Introduction of New Employees/Promotions

Nick Siesinger is the new Central Communication Specialist in the ICC. He previously worked in the signal department. John Togher was promoted to the new Director of Accounting position. Cory Kadleck is the new financial accountant. He has an MBA and experience with the Office of the Auditor of the State. Andrew Scott was promoted to system analyst. He was previously hired as an intern in 2015. He graduated from the University of Akron in 2016 and joined RTA through the Management Development Program.

Citizens' Advisory Board

There was no report.

Introduction of resolutions

- A. 2018-36 – Expressing congratulations to the employees of the Greater Cleveland Regional Transit Authority who retired during the first quarter of 2018, the adoption of which was moved by Mr. Serrano, seconded by Mayor Elkins and approved by unanimous vote.

Paul Burlij worked for 13 years in Engineering and Project Management. Bobby Kimbro, Jr., Triskett operator for 16 years and Jerry Masek, publications manager for 18 years. Mayor Clough thanked them for their service.

- B. 2018-37 – Authorizing Contract No. 2017-142 with Millstone Management Group, Inc. to provide the Opportunity Corridor East 105th Street Transit Waiting Environment Program in a total contract amount not to exceed \$396,000.00 (RTA Development Fund, Programming and Planning Department budget), the adoption of which was moved by Mr. Serrano, seconded by Mayor Elkins and approved by unanimous vote. It passes.

This is to purchase and install bus shelters, trash cans, benches and solar lighting along Opportunity Corridor.

- C. 2018-38 – Authorizing Contract No. 2017-150 with LTK Consulting Services, Inc., dba LTK Engineering Services to provide consulting services for rail car evaluation for a period of one year in an amount not to exceed \$400,000.00 (RTA Development Fund, Fleet Management Department budget), the adoption of which was moved by Mr. Serrano, seconded by Chief McCall. Ms. Britt asked to abstain. There were eight (8) ayes and one abstention by Mr. Britt. It passes.
- D. 2018-39 – Authorizing Contract No. 2017-170 with HDR Engineering, Inc. for Project 17.10 – Special Bridge Inspections in an amount not to exceed \$540,703.00 (RTA Development Funds, Engineering & Project Development Department budget), the adoption of which was moved by Mayor Welo, seconded by Chief McCall. Ms. Britt asked to abstain. There were eight (8) ayes and one abstention by Mr. Britt. It passes.
- E. 2018-40 – Authorizing Contract No. 2018-010 with WSP USA Inc. for project 17.50 – On-Call Rail Engineering Services 2018 in an amount not to exceed \$400,000.00 for a period of 24 months (RTA Development Fund, Engineering & Project Development Department budget), the adoption of which was moved by Mayor Welo, seconded by Mr. Serrano. There were eight (8) ayes and one abstention by Mr. Britt. It passes.

- F. 2018-41 – Authorizing Contract No. 2018-019 with HWH Architects Engineers Planners, Inc. for Project 17.74 – On-Call Architectural/Engineering Services in an amount not to exceed \$300,000.00 for a period of 24 months (RTA Capital and/or RTA Development Funds, Engineering & Project Development Department budget), the adoption of which was moved by Mr. Serrano, seconded by Mayor Welo. There were eight (8) ayes and one abstention by Mr. Britt. It passes.
- G. 2018-42 – Authorizing Contract No. 2018-025 with Roma Designs, LLC for Project 17.63 – Louis Stokes-Windermere Station roof repairs, at a total amount of \$157,000.00 (RTA Capital Fund, Engineering & Project Development Department budget), the adoption of which was moved by Mayor Welo, seconded by Mr. Serrano. There were eight (8) ayes and one abstention by Mr. Britt. It passes.

Ms. Moss asked if staff is ok with one bid and was it within the budget. Mr. Schipper stated that this project is within the budget. It was over the estimate. They spoke to some of the bidders who didn't bid. There is specialty work in the skylights that some vendors could not perform. They are ok with the contractor. They have been a subcontractor in the past.

- H. 2018-43 – Authorizing Contract No. 2018-26 with Gillig LLC for the furnishing of 110, 150k predictive maintenance kits, as specified and as required, for a period of one year in an amount not to exceed \$511,498.90 (General Fund, Fleet Management Department budget), the adoption of which was moved by Mr. Serrano, seconded by Mayor Elkins. There were eight (8) ayes and one abstention by Mr. Britt. It passes.

Mayor Clough explained that Ms. Britt is abstaining because she didn't have enough time to review the resolutions before the meeting and doesn't feel comfortable voting on them. The other board members have received the information ahead a time and can ask questions of the staff before the meeting.

- I. 2018-44 – Authorizing Contract No. 2018-029 with Cook Paving & Construction Co., Inc. for Project 24V – Farnsleigh Station Reconstruction, as specified and as required, in an amount not to exceed \$898,898.00 (RTA Development Fund, Engineering & Project Development Department budget), the adoption of which was moved by Mr. Serrano, seconded by Ms. McCall. There were eight (8) ayes and one abstention by Mr. Britt. It passes.
- J. 2018-45 – Authorizing Contract No. 2018-034 with Delta Railroad Construction, Inc. for Project 52P – Red Line West Rehabilitation – W. 117th to West Park, as specified and as required, in an amount not to exceed \$3,555,885.00 (RTA Development Fund, Engineering & Project Development Department budget), the adoption of which was moved by Mayor Welo, seconded by Mr. Serrano. There were seven (7) ayes and one abstention by Mr. Britt. Mayor Welo stepped away. It passes.

Mayor Welo added that she and Mr. Schipper speak regularly to discuss the projects and bids. As the chair of the Operational Planning & Infrastructure Committee, she's had an opportunity to meet with his employees.

- K. 2018-46 – Amending Resolution No. 2018-023 to provide for an increase in the appropriation for the Law Enforcement Fund in the amount of \$25,000, the adoption of which was moved by Mr. Serrano, seconded by Ms. McCall. There were seven (7) ayes and one abstention by Mr. Britt. Mayor Welo stepped away. It passes.

- L. 2018-47 – Making appropriations for the current expenses and other expenditures of capital improvement funds for the Greater Cleveland Regional Transit Authority during fiscal year 2019, the adoption of which was moved by Mr. Serrano, seconded by Chief McCall. There were eight (8) ayes and one abstention by Mr. Britt. It passes.
- M. 2018-48 – Authorizing the CEO, General Manager/Secretary-Treasurer to enter into an agreement with Medina County to exchange Section 5307 and Section 5339 funds for local dollars on behalf of Medina County Public Transit, the adoption of which was moved by Mr. Serrano, seconded by Mayor Welo. There were eight (8) ayes and one abstention by Mr. Britt. It passes.
- N. 2018-49 – Authorizing a Memorandum of Understanding with NOACA, Laketran, Medina County Transit, Lorain County Transit and ODOT for the purpose of meeting federal requirements for performance based planning, the adoption of which was moved by Mr. Serrano, seconded by Mayor Welo. There were seven (7) ayes and two (2) resuses. Ms. Britt and Chief McCall recused themselves because of her relationship with NOACA. It passes.

General Manager/Secretary-Treasurer's Report

There is a lot of public outreach going on this week. ODOT is holding two meetings today about the future of transportation in the state. There is a meeting this afternoon at NOACA and tonight at the Shaker Library. RTA presenters will be at both meetings speaking about the need for greater funding for public transit. Joe will attend the GCP Annual Meeting tonight where RTA will be awarded the employer diversity award. Tomorrow, he will be on WCPN talking about public transit's role in the community. Tomorrow there is the STC Annual Meeting and a SWOT analysis with several RTA business partners in preparation to update the Long Range Plan.

Thursday, Joe will present to GCP's Government Affairs Council about more revenue for public transit. Also Thursday is OPTA's Executive Committee Meeting and Destination Cleveland Annual Meeting. On May 21, there will be a follow-up meeting with the U.S. Department of State on Human Trafficking. Dr. Caver will lead this meeting. Individuals from 18 different countries will be involved. On May 23, there will be a Meeting of the Minds presentation on mobility and equity, where Joe will be a panelist. The E. 116th Street ground-breaking is May 30. RTA received the Government Fleet award. The Board approved the purchase of kits for the Gillig buses today as we go from preventative maintenance to predictive maintenance. Next week, Corporate College will honor RTA and Joe as one of the Smart 50 classes.

Ridership for April has improved. Bus was down 4%, improved from being down 7% YTD. Rail was up 6%. Paratransit stayed at 5%. Trolleys were up 11% YTD. Sales tax is up 2% in May above budget and slightly above budget YTD at .50%. The Lyft pilot program has provided 500 trips at an average cost of \$8.34 compared to \$40 per ride for paratransit service. Godwin McNeal was recognized for 40 years of safe driving. Grant Segal of the Plain Dealer did a story on him. New York Times and Washington Post also published the story. RTA received the APTA Gold Safety Award. Steve Bitto played the video that aired at the APTA Bus meeting.

Reconsider Resolution No. 2018-36

Mayor Clough asked for a motion to reconsider Resolution No. 2018-36 so that Ms. Britt can abstain. It was moved by Mr. Serrano, seconded by Mayor Elkins.

- A. Resolution No. 2018-36 – Expressing congratulations to the employees of the Greater Cleveland Regional Transit Authority who retired during the first quarter of 2018. There were eight (8) ayes and one abstention by Mr. Britt. It passes.

Another retiree came in. Janice Williams, Triskett operator with 30 years' experience.

Old Business

Mayor Welo thanked Rev. Lucas and Mr. Serrano for their support as she emceed this year's Annual Awards Banquet. Bus, rail, Paratransit, Transit Police and staff were honored for their service in 2017. As Joe mentioned, operator, Godwin McNeal was honored for 40 years of safe driving with no accidents. There were 26 operators with 590 years combined of accident free driving.

Questions or comments from the audience (2 minutes)

1. Rev. Pamela Pinkney-Butts – Bedford, OH – She's been praying for RTA. She's been attending meetings for 15 years. She is concerned about how Mr. Dixon is being treated. The federal government is in violation of his rights within Title VI. Mr. Dixon has not been given fair opportunities for the legal process against him. Joe, George, Valarie and Sonny were present for her when she was homeless. The public should have an opportunity to know what is going on with Mr. Dixon. It's a violation of his rights for his voice not to be heard. She demands the investigation be called off. If the entire board is not investigated, then others should not be. Mr. Dixon is being attacked politically because he has been investigating racism and other acts of discrimination within RTA. She was denied membership to the CAB.
2. Robert Burton – He's been a care giver with Cleveland Clinic Foundation for over 35 years. He works with the Western Reserve Area Agency on Aging. He complained that the operators don't stop for people with disabilities. Students with autism, injuries and developmental issues are being treated badly by operators. Mr. Calabrese apologized and directed him to follow-up with Dr. Caver.
3. James Lamb – Cleveland, OH – He's complained about operators leaving people with physical limitations. He opposed the board's Special Board Meeting. He believes that Chief McCall is most qualified to lead the Board. He ask that the riders be taken seriously. The fares make the payroll. He's still upset about not having weekend service on the #81. He spoke of the bus shelter on W. 7th but no service goes there on the weekends. Steelyard is not being serviced by the cuts made to that bus route. He requested a meeting with the board. Mayor Clough added that any meeting of the board would need to be a public meeting, but one on one meetings are ok.
4. Peggy Casrick – Bedford, OH – It's hard for her to get her cart toward the designated area on the HL with having to pay at the front of the vehicle.
5. Marvin Randalson – Lakewood, OH – He's with Clevelanders for Public Transit. They've seen a lot of positive change over the last six months. A fare increase has been postponed, service cuts delayed and the conversation around public transportation has been elevated. Yet there is still work to do. Lack of revenue is still an issue and the only way to stabilize service for the future. He thanked staff and board members for their positive engagement with riders and their members. He asked the board to place new revenue on the ballot this November. RTA has never asked for a tax increase beyond the current 1% sales tax. No other organization have gone so long without asking for additional revenue. Everyone has to do a better job talking about the benefits of public transit.

6. Dan McCarthy – Cleveland, OH – He's a student that has been riding for 10 years. He's worked with a lot of vulnerable communities where there was not access to cars. He is concerned about service cuts and what it will do to the community. He'd like fares to be more affordable. Public transit is the best way for students to get around. He'd appreciate anything that can be done to help the community.
7. Loh – Cleveland, OH – RTA has done lots of work to improve. The damage on its image, loss of the population and jobs didn't happen in one day. Revenues are not enough to support RTA. If the damage can be reversed, RTA's work can be recognized, its image improved and the people served will benefit. She supports a revenue issue on the November ballot.

Executive Session Requested

10:06 a.m. – Mayor Clough asked for a motion to go into executive session to discuss charges against a public official. It was moved by Chief McCall, seconded by Mr. Norton. There were nine (9) ayes and none opposed.

Mayor Clough added that there are other committee meetings that will commence after the executive session, but there is no approximate time period.

1:03 p.m. – Mayor Clough asked for a motion to come out of executive session. It was moved by Mayor Elkins, seconded by Chief McCall. There were eight (8) ayes and one (1) opposed by Mr. Norton.

Mayor Clough stated that there would be several motions made regarding future actions as a result of their preliminary investigation findings.

Resend/Repeal Resolution No. 1994-35

Mayor Elkins made a motion to resend/repeal Resolution No. 1994-35 regarding the ability of a board member to be provided healthcare through RTA. It was seconded by Mayor Welo. The roll was called. There were nine (9) ayes and none opposed. If there is a need to have a follow-up resolution, it needs to be put on the next meeting agenda.

Charges against a public official

Ms. Moss made a motion directing the Internal Auditor, who reports to the Board and special council, to report the preliminary investigation results regarding the healthcare benefits, to the appropriate authorities, including the Cuyahoga County prosecutor's office, the State Auditor and Ohio Ethics Commission. It was seconded by Mr. Norton. The roll was called. There were nine (9) ayes and none opposed.

The next regular Board Meeting and Annual Meeting is scheduled for Tuesday, June 19, 2018, in the Board Room of the Authority, Root-McBride Building, 1240 West Sixth Street, Cleveland, Ohio 44113.

This meeting was adjourned at 1:06 p.m.



President

Attest: 

CEO, General Manager/Secretary-Treasurer